Epigenetic and experimental modifications in early mammalian development: Part II

Culture of preimplantation embryos and its long-term effects on gene expression and phenotype

Sanjeev Khosla^{1,3}, Wendy Dean¹, Wolf Reik¹ and Robert Feil^{1,2,4}

¹Programme in Developmental Genetics, The Babraham Institute, Cambridge CB2 4AT, UK and ²Institute of Molecular Genetics, CNRS, UMR 5535, 1919 Route de Mende, 34293 Montpellier cedex 5, France

A growing number of medical, scientific and biotechnological procedures rely on culture of mammalian preimplantation embryos. This review presents currently available data on aberrant offspring development that sometimes arises from commonly applied in-vitro procedures in humans, ruminant species and mice. Comparison between mammalian species reveals similarities in the phenotypic abnormalities that are observed at fetal and perinatal stages of development. In particular, aberrant effects on fetal growth have been observed in multiple studies in which serum complemented the preimplantation culture medium. Although it remains to be determined whether there is a common causal mechanism(s) involved, several hypotheses have been put forward to account for the variety of the observed developmental abnormalities. One of these postulates that culture can result in the epigenetic deregulation of developmentally important genes, and that such epigenetic alterations would affect in particular the expression of genes that are subject to genomic imprinting. Imprinted genes play key roles in the control of fetal growth, and altered imprinting can cause growth defects. Some recent in-vitro culture studies on mice and ruminant species now lend support to this hypothesis.

Key words: assisted reproduction/embryo culture/epigenetic/imprinting/large offspring syndrome

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Introduction
The effects of preimplantation culture and manipulation
In-vitro culture experiments
Hypotheses
Aberrant growth and imprinted genes
Outlook
Acknowledgements
Note added in proof
References

Introduction

Many medical, scientific and commercial interventions today rely on in-vitro manipulation and culture of mammalian embryos at different time points during early development. Amongst others, these include generation of transgenic animals, gene targeting and assisted reproduction technologies in humans and domestic animals; cloning from embryonic and adult cells also involves manipulation and culture. In recent years, however, a growing number of reports have documented adverse effects of such procedures on post-implantation growth and development. From some of these studies it is evident that the in-vitro production of morphologically normal preimplantation embryos does not guarantee that their post-implantation development and post-natal life will be normal. With the current medical, commercial and scientific interest in cloning from somatic cells, and the likely increasing use of early embryos and cells for scientific and clinical purposes, it is appropriate to understand the precise nature of culture and manipulation-induced abnormalities and to investigate the causal mechanisms involved. In this review, the currently available data on procedures that involve culture of

³Present address: Wellcome/CRC Institute of Cancer and Developmental Biology, University of Cambridge, UK

⁴To whom correspondence should be addressed at: Institute of Molecular Genetics, CNRS, UMR 5535, 1919 Route de Mende, 34293 Montpellier cedex 5, France. E-mail: feil@igm.cnrs-mop.fr

S.Khosla et al.

mammalian preimplantation embryos are summarized, and their consequences for growth and differentiation during subsequent stages of development are discussed. Phenotypic effects of different procedures are presented for commonly studied mammalian species that are representative of primates (humans), ruminants (sheep and cattle) and rodents (mouse). This comparison between mammalian groups reveals certain similarities in the phenotypic consequences that are observed, and this suggests that there may be common underlying mechanisms. Given the possibility of common mechanism(s), it is interesting to note that they all involve culture in synthetic media, in many instances, complemented with serum. In addition, it is the culture part of various procedures that has been shown to affect phenotype at post-implantation stages of development. This deregulation of developmentally important genes is likely to be epigenetic in nature. It has been postulated, by us and by others (Nagy et al., 1993; Moore and Reik, 1996; Dean et al., 1998; Young et al., 2000; Khosla et al., 2001), that such epigenetic alterations would affect in particular the expression of genes that are subject to genomic imprinting. Several recent studies on mice and ruminant species lend support to this hypothesis.

The effects of preimplantation culture and manipulation

Phenotypic consequences of culture and manipulation of preimplantation embryos, and their frequencies of occurrence, are extremely diverse (Table I). Aberrant fetal growth is observed in all the different mammalian species studied and can arise as a consequence of different in-vitro interventions. Below, we list the phenotypic effects during fetal and perinatal development, of common in-vitro procedures on preimplantation human, ruminant and mouse conceptuses.

Humans

IVF and intracytoplasmic sperm injection (ICSI) procedures involve fertilization of mature oocytes with spermatozoa, followed by culture of fertilized embryos to usually the 2- to 4cell stage (corresponding to day 2-3 embryos) (Tesarik and Mendoza, 1999). Embryos are then transferred to the uterus of a prospective mother. There have been several reports that consider the outcome of these assisted conception technologies, including articles on conventional in-vitro maturation (IVM) and IVF procedures, and on ICSI (van Steirteghem, 1998). Few studies, however, have systematically analysed the effects of these procedures in comparison with suitable control groups (Leese et al., 1998), and interpretation of data is confounded by the fact that assisted reproduction technologies give rise to high rates of multiple pregnancies. Overall, it appears that, at least single births are not significantly affected by IVF procedures (Ménézo et al., 2000). However, in one large study (Tan et al., 1992) it was reported that about 25% of babies produced by conventional IVF were born prematurely, and this was a significantly higher proportion than the value of 6% for non-assisted pregnancies in England and Wales (which were taken as the control group). An increase in the incidence of pre-term deliveries upon IVF was observed by several other groups as well (Australian In-Vitro Fertilization group, 1985; Doyle et al., 1992; Wang et al., 1994; Doyle, 1999; Tarlatzis and Grimbizis, 1999). Low birth weight and fetal growth retardation, as measured by ultrasonographic

scanning revealing fetuses that were small for their gestational age, have also been reported in these latter studies. In addition, several groups described an increased risk of hypertension in the mother (requiring hospitalization) and vaginal bleeding at the time of delivery (due to placenta previa) upon IVF treatment (Doyle et al., 1992; Tan et al., 1992; Tanbo et al., 1995; Doyle, 1999). However, in extensive French IVF studies (FIVNAT, 1995; Ménézo et al., 2000), these particular risks were found to be comparable with those in the general population. Similarly, a higher incidence of pre-term deliveries and low-birth weight for babies produced by ICSI have been reported in one study (Aytoz et al., 1999), but this was not observed by others (Wennerholm et al., 1996; Wisanto et al., 1996; Bowen et al., 1998). The effect of cryopreservation of human embryos has also been investigated and again, results from different laboratories seem conflicting. One group (Sutcliffe et al., 1995) reported lower birth weight and a slightly shortened gestation period for frozen-thawed embryos relative to that for embryos in naturally conceived pregnancies, but this was not detected in another study (Wennerholm et al., 1997).

In recent years, assisted reproduction programmes in some countries have extended the period of in-vitro culture, sometimes to the blastocyst stage, in order to improve pregnancy rates after embryo transfer (Gardner and Lane, 1997). The effects of such extended periods of culture have not been documented. Given the sometimes dramatic consequences of in-vitro culture in ruminants and rodent species (see below), there may be a need to evaluate extended culture with great care (Gardner and Lane, 1997; Leese *et al.*, 1998; te Velde *et al.*, 1998).

Although in the studies which report negative consequences of in-vitro procedures there seems to be a down-regulation of growth, it should be recognized that early embryonic, non-genetic effects can also lead to enhanced growth in humans. For instance, Beckwith-Wiedemann syndrome (BWS) in humans is characterized by fetal and post-natal growth enhancement, organomegaly, macroglossia, hemihypertrophy, Wilms' tumour of the kidney and other complications. A number of studies implicate the imprinted insulin-like growth factor 2 (IGF2) gene and neighbouring imprinted genes on chromosome 11p15.5 in this fetal overgrowth syndrome. Since BWS is sporadic in a high proportion of cases, causal mutations are thought to be epigenetic in many of the patients, and such epigenetic alterations arise most likely during early development (Reik and Maher, 1997; Maher and Reik, 2000). Interestingly, several of the phenotypic abnormalities in BWS, including fetal overgrowth and disproportionate enlargement of internal organs, are not dissimilar to those observed in the culture-induced large offspring syndrome (LOS) in cattle and sheep (see below).

Cattle and sheep

There is extensive documentation on abnormalities that arise as a consequence of in-vitro culture of ruminant pre-elongation embryos (i.e. culture before elongation of the blastocyst; in ruminants, implantation occurs many days after the formation of the blastocyst only, at an early fetal stage). These aberrant phenotypes have been recently referred to as the LOS (Walker et al., 1996; Young et al., 1998; Sinclair et al., 2000). The main characteristic of LOS is increased fetal growth, and newborn animals are significantly heavier than control animals, frequently

Table I. Phenotypic consequences of in-vitro culture and manipulation procedures

Species	Procedure	Consequences	Key references
Humans	IVF	Reduced fetal growth and low birth weight Pre-term delivery Placental abnormalities	Australian In-Vitro Fertilization Group (1985); Tan et al., (1992); Doyle et al. (1992); Wang et al. (1994); Aytoz et al. (1999)
	Cryopreservation	Low birth weight	Sutcliffe et al. (1995)
Sheep and cattle	Embryo culture	Increased birth weight Fetal and perinatal death Dystocia Increased gestation length Polyhydramnios Skeletal and organ abnormalities	Walker <i>et al.</i> (1992); Farin and Farin (1995); Thompson <i>et al.</i> (1995); Walker <i>et al.</i> (1996); Kruip and den Daas (1997); Sinclair <i>et al.</i> (1999)
	Cloning	Increased birth weight Fetal and perinatal death Dystocia	Keefer <i>et al.</i> (1994); Wilson <i>et al.</i> (1995); Kruip and den Daas (1997); Wilmut <i>et al.</i> (1997); Kato <i>et al.</i> (1998); Schnieke <i>et al.</i> (1997); Cibelli <i>et al.</i> (1998a,b); Kubota <i>et al.</i> (2000)
	IVF	Increased fetal growth and birth weight	Sinclair <i>et al.</i> (1995); Behboodi <i>et al.</i> (1995); Farin and Farin (1995)
Mouse	Embryo culture	Reduced fetal weight Increased fetal death	Bowman and McLaren (1970); Caro and Trounson (1984); Arny <i>et al.</i> (1987); van der Auwera <i>et al.</i> (1999); Khosla <i>et al.</i> (2001)
	Cloning	Increased placental weight Fetal and perinatal death	Wakayama <i>et al.</i> (1998, 1999); Wakayama and Yanagimachi (1999)
	ES cell derivation and culture	Increased fetal and neonatal weight Fetal and perinatal death Polyhydramnios	Nagy et al. (1990, 1993); Wang et al. (1997); Dean et al. (1998)
	Pronuclear transfer	Reduced fetal weight	Reik et al. (1993); Römer et al. (1997)
	Cryopreservation	Increased adult weight	Dulioust et al. (1995)

ES = embryonic stem.

with a 2-fold or more increase in weight. This extreme fetal growth has been observed both in sheep (Walker et al., 1992, 1996: Thompson et al., 1995) and in cattle (Behboodi et al., 1995: Sinclair et al., 1995; Kruip and den Daas, 1997; McEvoy et al., 1998). Increased incidences of death during pregnancy and at around the time of birth are other commonly observed phenotypes associated with LOS. The perinatal death is due most frequently to complications during delivery, or to dysfunctional lungs, but in some cases specific congenital abnormalities have also been observed (Walker et al., 1992, 1996; Behboodi et al., 1995; Sinclair et al., 2000). Additional LOS phenotypes, in cattle and sheep, include extended gestational length (which only partially accounts for the increase in birthweight), polyhydramnios (Sinclair et al., 1999), dystocia (difficulty in giving birth), and poor development and reduced viability during the first few weeks after birth (Walker et al., 1992; Behboodi et al., 1995; Farin and Farin, 1995; Thompson *et al.*, 1995; Kruip and den Daas, 1997). Furthermore, LOS has been reported sometimes to involve also specific skeletal abnormalities, and can give rise to organomegaly of internal organs, in particular of the liver and heart (Farin and Farin, 1995; Walker et al., 1996; Kruip and den Daas, 1997; McEvoy et al., 1998; Sinclair et al., 1999).

Cloning involves the transfer of nuclei from undifferentiated or differentiated somatic cells into enucleated oocytes. Reconstructed embryos are activated, cultured in synthetic medium for a defined period of time, and then transferred into the uterus of a synchronized recipient (Campbell et al., 1996; Wells et al., 1999). Recent reports on cloned sheep and cattle have described abnormalities during post-implantation development of reconstructed embryos that are similar to those associated with LOS. Unusually heavy offspring were obtained upon cloning in cattle (Wilson et al., 1995; Wells et al., 1999; Kubota et al., 2000) and sheep (Schnieke et al., 1997). Sudden perinatal death in up to half of the cloned animals has also been reported (Keefer et al., 1994; Campbell et al., 1996; Schnieke et al., 1997; Wells et al., 1997; Wilmut et al., 1997; Cibelli et al., 1998a; Kato et al., 1998; Kubota et al., 2000). In cattle, a proportion of these deaths is thought to be caused by hydrallantois (excess accumulation of allantoic fluid) (Stice et al., 1996; Wells et al., 1999). Like early embryo culture in cattle and sheep, cloning can also be associated with specific congenital abnormalities such as cleft palate and mandibular defects (i.e. undershot jaw; Schnieke et al., 1997; Wells et al., 1997).

Increased fetal growth and, as a consequence, higher than normal birth weights have been reported to occur as a consequence of IVM of oocytes and IVF (Behboodi *et al.*, 1995; Farin and Farin, 1995; Sinclair *et al.*, 1995; Table I). Again, these are procedures that involve culture.

S.Khosla et al.

Mice

Few studies on mice document post-implantation consequences of in-vitro culturing of preimplantation embryos. It has been reported (Bowman and McLaren, 1970) that fetuses derived from mouse embryos that had been cultured from the 8-cell to the blastocyst stage were lighter than control fetuses at day 17 of gestation. These authors also reported a reduced post-implantation viability of cultured embryos. Reduced viability as a consequence of in-vitro culture was also noted by several other groups (Caro and Trounson, 1984; Arny et al., 1987; Lane and Gardner, 1994; van der Auwera et al., 1999; Khosla et al., 2001). Indeed, a 20% reduction in weight for fetuses (on day 14 day of gestation) derived from blastocysts that had been cultured in a chemically defined medium containing serum has been described (Khosla et al., 2001).

Nuclear transfer experiments (cloning) in the mouse, that use either undifferentiated or differentiated somatic cells, were also reported to reduce post-implantation viability significantly (Wakayama et al., 1998, 1999; Wakayama and Yanagimachi, 1999). Amongst other phenotypic consequences, increased incidences of perinatal death and abnormally large placentae were reported in these studies. Another procedure that involves culture of preimplantation embryos is the derivation of embryonic stem (ES) cells, and once derived, ES cell lines are frequently cultured for prolonged periods of time for their use in the generation of transgenic animals (Nagy et al., 1993). However, completely ES cell-derived mice obtained from high-passage cell lines were reported to be increased in weight at birth (Nagy et al., 1993; Wang et al., 1997) along with high incidences of perinatal death. In agreement with the different studies on newborn ESderived mice, increased weight of completely ES cell-derived fetuses was reported (Dean et al., 1998), and these authors also reported severe interstitial bleeding, polyhydramnios, and aberrant mandible development leading to an undershot jaw.

Pronuclear transfer experiments, where mouse pronuclei were exposed to the cytoplasmic environment of recipient fertilized oocytes, resulted in a growth retardation of about 15% in some of the experimental animals (Römer *et al.*, 1997). Cryopreservation of mouse embryos, though generally thought not to be a major cause of aberrances during post-implantation development, has been reported in one study to result in a small weight increase in adult animals between 39 and 67 weeks of age (Dulioust *et al.*, 1995). Effects of cryopreservation, however, appear to depend on the sex of the animal and on the mouse strain used. For instance, in one particular genetic background, a slight influence was noted on the postnatal development of the mandible (Dulioust *et al.*, 1995).

In-vitro culture experiments

Although the phenotypic abnormalities observed in different species are diverse, the various procedures applied seem all to lead to aberrant fetal growth in a proportion of the animals produced. It should be important to recognize that all the different procedures share incubation in culture medium. In studies that involve cloning from somatic nuclei (both in ruminant species and mice), for instance, donor cells are cultured prior to nuclear transfer and reconstructed embryos are cultured *in vitro* before

transfer to uteri of recipient females (Campbell et al., 1996; Schnieke et al., 1997; Wakayama and Yanagamachi, 1999). This is true also for in-vitro fertilized embryos (Tan et al., 1992; Behboodi et al., 1995) and for the derivation of ES cell-lines and their subsequent use for transgenic purposes. Several experiments have thus focused specifically on the consequences of in-vitro culturing of preimplantation embryos. The choice of medium for culture of preimplantation embryos is dependent on their metabolic and nutrient needs. Most culture media are based on the composition of the oviductal fluid, and differ mainly in the concentrations of the individual components (Lawitts and Biggers, 1993). In particular for ovine and bovine in-vitro culture, serum is added to culture media as a protein supplement to enhance the preimplantation development to the blastocyst stage (Bavister, 1995). However, some media do not include serum, or have bovine serum albumin (BSA) as a protein source. The virtuosity of a culture medium is usually judged by the ability of embryos to survive until a given developmental end-point, mostly the end of the preimplantation period (the pre-elongation period in ruminants) resulting in the production of blastocyststage embryos.

In sheep and cattle, many reports pertaining to the LOS relate to culture of pre-elongation embryos in culture medium (Walker et al., 1996; Young et al., 1998; Sinclair et al., 2000). Even though the culture systems with which LOS has been associated are varied, they frequently involve the addition of serum to enhance development to the blastocyst stage. Using different culture conditions [Synthetic Oviduct Fluid medium (SOF)+ serum, or SOF+BSA], it was shown (Thompson et al., 1995) that ovine embryos cultured in the presence of serum (SOF+serum) produced heavier lambs, even though the development of zygotes to the morula and blastocyst stages did not differ between different media. The effects of serum in the culture medium, and the consequences of co-culture with granulosa cells were also studied in detail (Sinclair et al., 1999). These studies on ovine embryos showed that both co-culture and presence of serum in the medium can affect fetal development, and thereby lead to LOS (Sinclair et al., 1999). Others (Behboodi et al., 1995; Farin and Farin, 1995) obtained similar results for bovine embryos.

With respect to the situation in rodents, it was shown that mouse fetuses derived from in-vitro cultured preimplantation embryos (from the 8-cell stage to blastocysts in Brinster's medium) were lighter than those derived from in-vivo control blastocysts (Bowman and McLaren, 1970). Another group (Lane and Gardner, 1994) were among the first to study the effects of specific components of the culture medium, and noted a beneficial effect of the inclusion of amino acids on post-implantation mouse development. In the same study, these authors demonstrated that (build-up of) ammonium in the culture medium retards fetal development and may give rise to exencephaly. In a recent study, the effects of serum in the medium (M16) were specifically addressed during culturing of preimplantation mouse embryos (Khosla et al., 2001). Serum was found to reduce the postimplantation viability of embryos, and the resulting fetuses were also significantly lighter than control fetuses. These findings agree with those of others (Caro and Trounson, 1984; Arny et al., 1987), who reported comparable effects of serum on the post-implantation viability of mouse embryos. In these studies on mouse embryos, the morphology of the blastocysts that had developed in the presence of serum was normal. This emphasizes that an apparently normal in-vitro growth to blastocysts does not guarantee that post-implantation development will be unaffected. Taken together, the systematic studies on ruminants and mice clearly demonstrate that certain culture conditions can have negative consequences for growth and development of embryos after their transfer into recipient females, but these conditions do not necessarily affect the in-vitro development to the blastocyst stage.

Hypotheses

Could there be common, molecular, mechanisms underlying the growth and other abnormalities observed as a consequence of in-vitro culture? As summarized above, different interventions can lead to alterations in fetal growth. This involves mostly a reduction where effects were observed in mice and humans, whereas growth tends to be enhanced in sheep and cattle. It should be recognized, however, that in-vitro culture in mice can also give rise to enhanced fetal growth (Dean et al., 1998), and in BWS in humans, epigenetic deregulation of the IGF2 gene and of neighbouring imprinted genes is associated with fetal overgrowth (Reik and Maher, 1997; Maher and Reik, 2000). Directional differences between mammalian groups do not exclude the possibility of there being a common causal mechanism(s). The physiology of embryonic and in particular of extra-embryonic development is rather different in ruminant species as compared with that in humans and rodents. Furthermore, in contrast to ruminant species, mice have multiple offspring and the intrauterine growth of individual offspring is to a far greater extent regulated by maternal effects. However, it is clear that the interventions in different mammalian species have in common that early embryos are subjected to the external stress of in-vitro culture, and that this can lead to aberrations in pathways that control fetal growth and development. Such a directed 'acquisition' of a phenotypic character as a consequence of environmental stress (Leese et al., 1998) would agree with proposed theories on canalization and genetic assimilation (Waddington, 1942; McLaren, 1999). These theories are applicable in particular where the emergent character is transmitted to the next generation(s). It is unclear whether this happens with LOS in which some of the abnormalities persist to adulthood (McEvoy et al., 1998), and it is also too early to determine transgenerational effects related to assisted conception technologies in humans. However, heritability to the next generation has been demonstrated for pronuclear transfer-induced growth-retardation in mice (Römer et al., 1997). Considering stress-induced altered use of regulatory and signalling pathways, 'canalization' (Waddington, 1942), it might be pertinent that recent studies on mice and cattle provide initial evidence for the deregulation of the IGF and other signalling pathways as a consequence of in-vitro culture during preimplantation development (see below).

To explain the diversity of the abnormalities that occur as a consequence of culture, and to account for their stochastic nature of occurrence, specific hypotheses need to consider causal mechanisms that can have a wide spectrum of action. It had been observed that the cytoplasm of cells in bovine embryos fragments upon in-vitro culturing (Shamsuddin, 1994). Since interaction of various cytoplasmic factors with the nucleus is

essential for normal development (Muggleton-Harris *et al.*, 1982; Evsikov *et al.*, 1990; Latham and Solter, 1991), this fragmentation of cytoplasm has been suggested to be a possible cause of the developmental deregulation (Walker *et al.*, 1996). Another postulate is based on the fact that embryos developing inside the oviduct of the mother receive signals and cues that are required for their subsequent implantation and development. These cues are lacking during in-vitro culture, and this absence of signalling molecules could result in the deregulation of genes under their influence (Walker *et al.*, 1996).

It has been observed that in-vitro culture in the presence of serum may alter the kinetics of development to the blastocyst stage (Pinyopummintr and Bavister, 1991; Walker et al., 1992; van Langendonckt et al., 1997; Khosla et al., 2001). In ruminants, such alterations, in particular during the compaction phase, have been reported to influence the number of cells allocated to the inner cell mass (ICM) of the blastocyst (Thompson, 1997). It has been postulated, therefore, that culture-induced changes in the allocation of cells between the ICM and trophectoderm (TE) could contribute to the LOS, for instance by promoting an increased placental size (Walker et al., 1996; Leese et al., 1998). Further research is required to determine whether, indeed, an increased allocation of cells to the TE promotes the development of larger extra-embryonic membranes and thereby influences the size of the fetus (Sinclair et al., 2000). Whatever in-vitro culture does to the early embryo, it might introduce a discrepancy between the developmental age of the embryo and the receptive state of the uterine environment. Such discrepancies, though small, could result in enhanced fetal growth following transfer into recipient females. For instance, increases in fetal weight at days 21 and 37 of gestation was observed following the transfer of ovine blastocysts that had been temporarily exposed to a uterine environment that was three days advanced (Wilmut and Sales, 1981). Whether this corresponds to LOS, however, is unclear (Sinclair et al., 2000), and in one other report describing a similar treatment, no consistent effect on fetal growth was observed (Sinclair et al., 1998).

A molecular hypothesis put forward by us and others postulates that culture of preimplantation embryos and cells can give rise to aberrant epigenetic modifications in genes (Nagy et al., 1993; Moore and Reik, 1996; Dean et al., 1998; Young et al., 2000; Khosla et al., 2001). After transfer of in-vitro cultured embryos, such alterations would be maintained somatically and might therefore affect gene expression at later, post-implantation, stages of development (Nagy et al., 1993; Dean et al., 1998). A well-studied example of a heritable, epigenetic feature that regulates gene expression in mammals, is DNA methylation. During early embryonic development, extensive changes in genome-wide methylation take place (Monk et al., 1987; Howlett and Reik, 1991; Yoder et al., 1997), and therefore any perturbation caused in the methylation process could potentially cause deregulation of development at later stages (Dean et al., 1998).

Aberrant growth and imprinted genes

A subset of genes within the mammalian genome is expressed from only one of the two alleles depending on whether the gene is inherited from mother or father. Genes that have such a parent-of-origin-specific manner of expression are known as 'imprinted' genes, and the corresponding epigenetic mechanism as 'genomic

S.Khosla et al.

imprinting' (Constância et al., 1998; Surani, 1998). Genetic studies have established that genomic imprinting is evolutionarily conserved among eutherian mammals, including humans, sheep and mice (Feil et al., 1998; Loi et al., 1998; Beechey et al., 1999; McLaren and Montgomery, 1999). Some 50 mammalian genes have been identified to be subject to imprinting, many of which play key roles in embryonic and extra-embryonic development (Beechey et al., 1999; Tilghman, 1999). Detailed studies on the role of DNA methylation in imprinting showed that at imprinted loci there are key regulatory sequences that are methylated on one of the two parental alleles only (Razin and Cedar, 1994). Significantly, at many of these 'differentially methylated regions' (DMRs) the allelic DNA methylation is established in either the male or the female germline, and is then somatically maintained throughout pre- and post-implantation development (Feil and Khosla, 1999). This contrasts with non-imprinted genes, which acquire their methylation patterns at later embryonic stages, upon or after gastrulation (Monk et al., 1987; Howlett and Reik, 1991; Yoder et al., 1997). This temporal difference in the ontogeny of methylation implies that imprinted genes might be particularly susceptible to methylation changes that occur as a consequence of in-vitro procedures during preimplantation development. It has been proposed, therefore, that fetal abnormalities observed as a consequence of culture during preimplantation development could be to a large part due to changes in the allelic methylation states of imprinted genes (Nagy et al., 1993; Moore and Reik, 1996; Dean et al., 1998). Furthermore, several imprinted genes are known to play key roles in fetal growth and development (Beechey et al., 1999), and alteration in expression of these imprinted genes can severely affect size and morphology of fetuses and newborn animals. This is possibly exemplified best by the studies on the mouse insulin-like growth factor-2 (Igf2) gene, which is located in an imprinted gene cluster on distal chromosome 7. Deregulation of the expression of Igf2 has been shown to severely affect growth in mice (DeChiara et al., 1990; Eggenschwiler et al., 1997; Sun et al., 1997). In humans, epigenetic deregulation of the IGF2 gene and flanking imprinted genes in the cluster has been implicated in the congenital overgrowth syndrome BWS (Reik and Maher, 1997; Maher and Reik, 2000). Some of the phenotypic abnormalities in BWS patients are not dissimilar to those observed in the LOS, and include fetal overgrowth and disproportionate enlargement of internal organs.

The postulated involvement of imprinted genes in cultureinduced phenotypic abnormalities has gained initial support from several experimental studies. In our laboratory, we have used a mouse model system to determine the effects of in-vitro culture on the maintenance of genomic imprinting in early mammalian cells (Dean et al., 1998). Deregulation of imprinted genes was frequently observed upon derivation and prolonged culture of mouse ES cell lines (in medium containing serum). This aberrant imprinted gene expression (at the Igf2, Igf2-receptor, and other imprinted loci) was associated with changes in the allelic methylation status of their regulatory DMRs. Significantly, epigenetic alterations in the ES cells did not become corrected during post-implantation development, and were associated with aberrant gene expression and phenotypic abnormalities in completely ES cell-derived fetuses (Dean et al., 1998). Relative to culture-induced loss of imprinting in murine ES cells, it should be interesting to note that human and bovine stem cell-like cells have been derived recently (Cibelli *et al.*, 1998b; Thomson *et al.*, 1998). Dependent on how regulations will evolve during the coming years, it seems likely that human stem cell-like cells will be increasingly used for various differentiation studies. For the bovine ES-like cells, it has been shown that they can be used for the production of transgenic chimeric animals (Cibelli *et al.*, 1998b). The chimeric animals in this study were reported to have LOS abnormalities that could have been caused by the derivation and culture of the stem cell-like cells, by the embryo culture and manipulation, or by a combination of these in-vitro procedures. Relative to the in-vitro use of differentiated cells, for instance for cloning purposes, it is interesting to note that relaxation of *Igf2* imprinting has been reported to occur upon culture of rat fibroblasts (Ungaro *et al.*, 1997).

In addition to the studies on murine ES cells, we investigated whether deregulation of imprinted gene expression can also occur upon culture of preimplantation mouse embryos (Khosla et al., 2001). Decreased expression of the *Igf2* and the neighbouring, imprinted, H19 gene was observed in many fetuses derived from blastocysts that had been cultured in the presence of fetal calf serum. On average, these 'serum group' fetuses were about 13% smaller than fetuses derived from blastocysts that had been grown in the absence of serum. In agreement with the altered gene expression, a differentially methylated region upstream of the H19 gene that had been shown to be important for the imprinting of H19 and Igf2 (Thorvaldsen et al., 1998), was found to be hypermethylated (Khosla et al., 2001). It may be that culture effects on imprinting are dependent on the culture medium used. For instance, in a recent study (Doherty et al., 2000) it was reported that culture of 2-cell embryos to blastocysts in Whitten's medium (without serum) leads to loss of (paternal) DNA methylation and gain of expression at the H19 gene. These recent studies complement an earlier report on disruption of imprinting of the H19 gene in extra-embryonic tissues as a consequence of in-vitro culture of early mouse embryos (Sasaki et al., 1995). Also, the expression of Grb10, a growth-related imprinted gene that is thought to have a negative effect on cellular proliferation (He et al., 1998), was significantly increased in the fetuses derived from embryos that had been cultured in the presence of serum (Khosla et al., 2001). GRB10 belongs to a family of 'growth receptor binding' adapter proteins which function in a tissuespecific manner to link specific receptor tyrosine kinases and other tyrosine phosphorylated proteins to downstream effectors, though its exact role is at present unknown (Daly, 1998). Alterations in the levels of IGF2 expression have also been documented in bovine fetuses that were derived from in-vitroproduced preimplantation embryos (Blondin et al., 2000). In this study, observed alterations seemed to be tissue-specific, with increased expression in the liver.

Few imprinting studies have been performed on the effects of IVF and ICSI procedures. Using a mouse model system, it was found that, at a low frequency, H19 expression was deregulated in embryos derived following spermatid or sperm injection (Shamanski *et al.*, 1999). In particular, these authors observed that in extra-embryonic tissues the normally repressed paternal H19 allele had become de-repressed in a proportion of the cells, most likely as a consequence of the fertilization procedure. In a recent human IVF study, children born after the application of ICSI were analysed for their allelic methylation status at a key

Preimplantation embryo culture and gene expression

regulatory region in the imprinted Prader–Willi syndrome (PWS) and Angelman syndrome (AS) regions on chromosome 15q11-q13 (Manning *et al.*, 2000). No irregular DNA patterns were detected in 92 children analysed, and none showed clinical symptoms of the neurodevelopmental imprinting disorders of PWS or AS.

Outlook

In this review we have discussed in-vitro procedures that can lead to aberrant fetal growth and development in different mammalian species. Although the protocols used are rather diverse, they all involve culture or incubation in media during varying lengths of time. Based on a large number of studies, it is thought that such in-vitro culture can be a possible cause of the phenotypic abnormalities observed, in particular where serum is present in the medium. Several hypotheses have been put forward to explain the phenotypic consequences of preimplantation in-vitro culture. Although, at present, data seem insufficient to draw firm conclusions, we favour the proposal that epigenetic deregulation of genes-in particular of imprinted genes-may be causally involved (Nagy et al., 1993; Moore and Reik, 1996; Dean et al., 1998; Young et al., 2000; Khosla et al., 2001). This molecular hypothesis proposes a memory mechanism that is heritable from the time of intervention to the later stages at which phenotypic abnormalities become apparent. Recent studies in the mouse provide evidence for epigenetic deregulation of imprinted genes as a consequence of in-vitro culture during preimplantation development (Dean et al., 1998; Khosla et al., 2001). As expected, the methylation changes observed were maintained throughout development and were associated with aberrant gene expression.

How culture can lead to epigenetic alterations in genes is unclear at present, and requires further study. One possibility would be that culture of early embryos and cells deregulates the kinetics of their growth and that this, in turn, interferes with the complex maintenance of methylation imprints (Feil and Khosla, 1999; Khosla et al., 2001). Indeed, it has been observed in different species, that embryos cultured in the presence of serum undergo some of the cleavage divisions at different rates as compared with those cultured without serum (Pinyopummintr and Bavister, 1991; Walker et al., 1992; van Langendonckt et al., 1997; Khosla et al., 2001). Culture, in particular in the presence of serum, could thus interfere with components of the cell cycle in undifferentiated cells, and this would result in the improper maintenance of epigenetic marks. Interestingly, several of the known methyltransferase enzymes (Robertson et al., 2000) and chromatin regulatory proteins (LeGouy et al., 1998; Voncken et al., 1999) are cell cycle-regulated and show major alterations in their expression during preimplantation development. Relative to a possible cell cycle deregulation of such enzymatic activities, it is interesting to note that imprinted genes also undergo epigenetic alterations in many types of tumours (where cells have lost control over their cell cycle), and frequently show expression from both parental chromosomes (Squire and Weksberg, 1996). This raises the question as to whether mechanism(s) involved in the deregulation of genes in cancer cells could be similar to the ones implicated in the deregulation of genes upon in-vitro culture. Future research should elucidate the molecular mechanisms and chromatin components that are involved in the normal cell cycle maintenance of epigenetic marks, to then be able to address the question as to how deregulation of the cell cycle can lead to heritable epigenetic alterations and altered gene expression.

Acknowledgements

Because of space constraints we have had to be selective in citing from the literature, and we apologize to those authors whose contributions we were unable to acknowledge. Our work cited in this review was supported by the Ministry of Agriculture, Fisheries and Food, the Human Frontier Science Programme, and the Royal Society.

Note added in proof

A recent study by Young and co-workers (Young *et al.*, 2001) demonstrates that in sheep, culture-induced LOS can be associated with *IGF2R* expression and methylation.

References

- Arny, M., Nachtigall, L. and Quagliarello, J. (1987) The effect of preimplantation culture conditions on murine embryo implantation and fetal development. *Fertil. Steril.*, 48, 861–865.
- Australian În-Vitro Fertilization group (1985) High incidence of preterm births and early loss in pregnancy after *in-vitro* fertilization. *Br. Med. J.*, **291**, 1160–1163.
- Aytoz, A., Van den Abbeel, E., Bonduelle, M. et al. (1999) Obstetric outcome of pregnancies after the transfer of cryopreserved and fresh embryos obtained by conventional in-vitro fertilization and intracytoplasmic sperm injection. Hum. Reprod., 14, 2619–2624.
- Bavister, B.D. (1995) Culture of preimplantation embryos: facts and artefacts. *Hum. Reprod. Update*, **1**, 91–148.
- Beechey, C.V., Cattanach, B.M. and Selley, R.L. (1999) MRC Mammalian Genetics Unit, Harwell, Oxfordshire. World Wide Web Site – Mouse imprinting data and references. (URL: http://www.mgu.har.mrc.ac.uk/ imprinting/imptables.html).
- Behboodi, E., Anderson, G.B., BonDurant, R.H. *et al.* (1995) Birth of large calves that developed from *in vitro*-derived bovine embryos. *Theriogenology*, **44**, 227–232.
- Blondin, P., Farin, P.W., Crosier, A.E. et al. (2000) In vitro production of embryos alters levels of insulin-like growth factor-II messenger ribonucleic acid in bovine fetuses 63 days after transfer. Biol. Reprod., 62, 384–389.
- Bowen, J.R., Gibson, F.L., Leslie, G.I. and Saunders, D.M. (1998) Medical and developmental outcome at 1 year for children conceived by intracytoplasmic sperm injection. *Lancet*, **351**, 1529–1534.
- Bowman, P. and McLaren, A. (1970) Viability and growth of mouse embryos after *in vitro* culture and fusion. *J. Embryol. Exp. Morphol.*, **23**, 693–704.
- Campbell, K.H.S., McWhir, J., Ritchie, W.A. et al. (1996) Sheep cloned by nuclear transfer from a cultured cell line. *Nature*, **380**, 64–66.
- Caro, C.M. and Trounson, A. (1984) The effect of protein on pre-implantation mouse embryo development in vitro. J. In-Vitro Fertil. Embryo Transfer, 1, 183–187.
- Cibelli, J.B., Stice, S.L., Golueke, P.J. et al. (1998a) Cloned transgenic calves produced from nonquiescent fetal fibroblasts. Science, 280, 1256–1268.
- Cibelli, J.B., Stice, S. L., Golueke, P.J. et al. (1998b) Transgenic bovine chimeric offspring produced from somatic cell-derived stem-like cells. *Nature Biotechnol.*, 16, 642–646.
- Constância, M., Pickard, B., Kelsey, G. et al. (1998) Imprinting mechanisms. Genome Res., 8, 881–900.
- Daly, R.J. (1998) The *Grb7* family of signalling proteins. *Cell. Signal.*, **10**, 613–618.
- Dean, W., Bowden, L., Aitchison, A. *et al.* (1998) Altered imprinted gene methylation and expression in completely ES cell-derived mouse fetuses: association with aberrant phenotypes. *Development*, **125**, 2273–2282.
- DeChiara, T.M., Efstratiadis, A. and Robertson, E.J. (1990) A growth-deficiency phenotype in heterozygous mice carrying an insulin-like growth factor-II gene disrupted by targeting. *Nature*, **345**, 78–80.
- Doherty, A.S., Mann, M.R., Tremblay, K.D. *et al.* (2000) Differential effects of culture on imprinted *H19* expression in the preimplantation embryo. *Biol. Reprod.*, **62**, 1526–1535.
- Doyle, P. (1999) The UK Human Fertilisation and Embryology Authority.

- How it has contributed to the evaluation of assisted reproduction technology. *Int. J. Tech. Assist. Health Care*, **15**, 3–10.
- Doyle, P., Beral, V. and Maconochie, N. (1992) Preterm delivery, low birthweight and small-for-gestational-age in liveborn singleton babies resulting from in-vitro fertilization. *Hum. Reprod.*, 7, 425–428.
- Dulioust, E., Toyama, K., Busnel, M.C. et al. (1995) Long-term effects of embryo freezing in mice. Proc. Natl Acad. Sci USA, 92, 589–593.
- Eggenschwiler, J., Ludwig, T., Fisher, P. et al. (1997) Mouse mutant embryos overexpressing IGF-II exhibit phenotypic features of the Beckwith-Wiedemann and Simpson-Golabi-Behmel syndromes. Genes Dev., 11, 3128–3142.
- Evsikov, S.V., Morozova, L.M. and Solomko, A.P. (1990) The role of the nucleocytoplasmic ratio in development regulation of the early mouse embryo. *Development*, 109, 323–328.
- Farin, P.W. and Farin, C.E. (1995) Transfer of bovine embryos produced in vivo or in vitro: survival and fetal development. Biol. Reprod., 52, 676–682.
- Feil, R. and Khosla, S. (1999) Genomic imprinting in mammals: an interplay between chromatin and DNA methylation? *Trends Genet.*, **15**, 431–435.
- Feil, R., Khosla, S., Cappai, P. et al. (1998) Genomic imprinting in ruminants: allele-specific gene expression in parthenogenetic sheep. Mamm. Genome, 9, 831–834.
- FIVNAT (French *In Vitro* National) (1995) Pregnancies and births resulting from *in vitro* fertilization: French national registry, analysis of data 1986 to 1990. *Fertil. Steril.*, **64**, 746–756.
- Gardner, D.K. and Lane, M. (1997) Culture and selection of viable blastocysts: a feasible proposition for human IVF? *Hum. Reprod. Update*, **3**, 367–382.
- He, W., Rose, D.W., Olefsky, J.M. et al. (1998) Grb10 interacts differentially with the insulin receptor, insulin-like growth factor I receptor, and epidermal growth factor receptor via the Grb10 Src homology 2 (SH2) domain and a second novel domain located between the pleckstrin homology and SH2 domains. J. Biol. Chem., 273, 6860–6867.
- Howlett, S.K. and Reik, W. (1991) Methylation levels of maternal and paternal genomes during pre-implantation development. *Development*, 113, 119–127.
- Kato, Y., Tani, T., Sotomaru, Y. et al. (1998) Eight calves cloned from somatic cells of a single adult. Science, 282, 2095–2098.
- Keefer, C.L., Stice, S.L. and Matthews, D.L. (1994) Bovine inner cell mass cells as donor nuclei in the production of nuclear transfer embryos and calves. *Biol. Reprod.*, 50, 935–939.
- Khosla, S., Dean, W., Brown, D. et al. (2001) Culture of pre-implantation mouse embryos affects fetal development and the expression of imprinted genes. Biol. Reprod., 64, 918–926.
- Kruip, T.A.M. and den Daas, J.H.G. (1997) In vitro produced and cloned embryos: effects on pregnancy, parturition and offspring. Theriogenology, 47, 43–52.
- Kubota, C., Yamakuchi, H., Todoroki, J. et al. (2000) Six cloned calves produced from adult fibroblast cells after long-term culture. Proc. Natl Acad. Sci. USA, 97, 990–995.
- Lane, M. and Gardner, D.K. (1994) Increase in postimplantation development of cultured mouse embryos by amino acids and induction of fetal retardation and exencephaly by ammonium ions. *J. Reprod. Fertil.*, **102**, 305–312.
- Latham, K.E. and Solter, D. (1991) Effect of egg composition on the developmental capacity of androgenetic mouse embryos. *Development*, 113, 561–568.
- Lawitts, J.A. and Biggers, J.D. (1993) Culture of preimplantation embryos. Methods Enzymol., 225, 153–164.
- Leese, H.J., Donnay, I. and Thompson, J.G. (1998) Human assisted conception: a cautionary tale. Lessons from domestic animals. *Hum. Reprod.*, 13, 184–202.
- LeGouy, E., Thompson, E.M., Muchardt, C. et al. (1998) Differential preimplantation regulation of two mouse homologues of the yeast SWI2 protein. Dev. Dynam., 212, 38–48.
- Loi, P., Ledda, S., Fulka, J. et al. (1998) Development of parthenogenetic and cloned ovine embryos: effect of activation protocols. Biol. Reprod., 58, 1177–1187.
- Manning, M., Lissens, W., Bonduelle, M. et al. (2000) Study of DNA-methylation patterns at chromosome 15q11-q13 in children born after ICSI reveals no imprinting defects. Mol. Hum. Reprod., 6, 1049–1053.
- Maher, E.R. and Reik, W. (2000) Beckwith-Wiedemann syndrome: imprinting in clusters revisited. J. Clin. Invest., 105, 247–252.
- McEvoy, T.G., Sinclair, K.D., Broadbent, P.J. et al. (1998) Post-natal growth and development of Simmental calves derived from in vivo or in vitro embryos. Reprod. Fertil. Dev., 10, 459–464.

- McLaren, A. (1999) Too late for the midwife toad: stress, variability and *Hsp90. Trends Genet.*, **15**, 169–171.
- McLaren, R.J. and Montgomery, G.W. (1999) Genomic imprinting of the insulin-like growth factor 2 gene in sheep. *Mamm. Genome*, 10, 588–591.
- Ménézo, Y.J.R., Veiga, V. and Pouly, J.L. (2000) Assisted reproductive technologies (ART) in humans: facts and uncertainties. *Theriogenology*, 53, 599–610.
- Muggleton-Harris, A., Whittingham, D.G. and Wilson, L. (1982) Cytoplasmic control of pre-implantation development in vitro in the mouse. *Nature*, 299, 460–462.
- Monk, M., Boubelik, M. and Lehnert, S. (1987) Temporal and regional changes in DNA methylation in the embryonic, extra-embryonic and germ cell lineages during mouse embryo development. *Development*, 99, 371–382.
- Moore, T. and Reik, W. (1996) Genetic conflict in early development: parental imprinting in normal and abnormal growth. *Rev. Reprod.*, **1**, 73–77.
- Nagy, A., Gocza, E., Diaz, E.M. et al. (1990) Embryonic stem cells alone are able to support fetal development in the mouse. Development, 110, 815–821.
- Nagy, A., Rossant, J., Nagy, R. et al. (1993) Derivation of completely cell culture-derived mice from early-passage embryonic stem cells. Proc. Natl Acad. Sci. USA, 90, 8424–8428.
- Pinyopummintr, T. and Bavister, B.D. (1991) *In vitro*-matured/*in vitro*-fertilized bovine oocytes can develop into morulae/blastocysts in chemically defined protein-free culture media. *Biol. Reprod.*, **45**, 736–742.
- Razin, A. and Cedar, H. (1994) DNA methylation and genomic imprinting. Cell, 77, 473–476.
- Reik, W. and Maher, E.R. (1997) Imprinting in clusters: lessons from Beckwith-Wiedemann syndrome. *Trends Genet.*, **13**, 330–334.
- Reik, W., Römer, I., Barton, S.C. *et al.* (1993) Adult phenotype in the mouse can be affected by epigenetic events in the early embryo. *Development*, **119**, 933–942.
- Robertson, K.D., Keyomarsi, K., Gonzales, F.A. *et al.* (2000) Differential mRNA expression of the human DNA methyltransferase (DNMTs) 1, 3A and 3B during G(0)/G1 phase transition in normal and tumor cells. *Nucleic Acids Res.*, **28**, 2108–2113.
- Römer, I., Reik, W., Dean, W. et al. (1997) Epigenetic inheritance in the mouse. Curr. Biol., 7, 277–280.
- Sasaki, H., Ferguson-Smith, A.C., Shum, A.S.W. et al. (1995) Temporal and spatial regulation of H19 imprinting in normal and uniparental mouse embryos. Development, 121, 4195–4202.
- Schnieke, A.E., Kind, A.J., Ritchie, W.A. et al. (1997) Human factor IX transgenic sheep produced by transfer of nuclei from transfected fetal fibroblasts. Science, 278, 2130–2133.
- Shamanski, F.L., Kimura, Y., Lavoir, M.C. et al. (1999) Status of genomic imprinting in mouse spermatids. Hum. Reprod., 14, 1050–1056.
- Shamsuddin, M. (1994) Effect of growth factors on bovine blastocyst development in a serum-free medium. Acta Vet. Scand., 35, 141–147.
- Sinclair, K.D., Broadbent, P.J. and Dolman, D.F. (1995) *In vitro*-produced embryos as a means of achieving pregnancy and improving productivity in beef cattle. *Anim. Sci.*, 60, 55–64.
- Sinclair, K.D., Dunne, L.D., Maxfield, E.K. et al. (1998) Fetal growth and development following temporary exposure of Day 3 ovine embryos to an advanced uterine environment. Reprod. Fertil. Dev., 10, 263–269.
- Sinclair, K.D., McEvoy, T.G., Maxfield, E.K. et al. (1999) Aberrant fetal growth and development after in vitro culture of sheep zygotes. J. Reprod. Fertil., 116, 177–186.
- Sinclair, K.D., Young, L.E., Wilmut, I. and McEvoy, T.G. (2000) In utero overgrowth in ruminants following embryo culture: lessons from mice and a warning to men. Hum. Reprod., 15 (Suppl. 5), 68–86.
- Stice, S.L., Strelchenko, N.S., Keefer, C.L. and Matthews, L. (1996) Pluripotent bovine embryonic cell lines direct embryonic development following nuclear transfer. *Biol. Reprod.*, 54, 100–110.
- Squire, J. and Weksberg, R. (1996) Genomic imprinting in tumours. *Semin. Cancer Biol.*, **7**, 41–47.
- Sun, F.L., Dean, W.L., Kelsey, G. et al. (1997) Trans-activation of Igf2 in a mouse model of Beckwith-Wiedemann syndrome. Nature, 389, 809–815.
- Surani, M.A. (1998) Imprinting and the initiation of gene silencing in the germ line. Cell, 93, 309–312.
- Sutcliffe, A.G., D'Souza, S.W., Cadman, J. et al. (1995) Minor congenital anomalies, major congenital malformations and development in children conceived from cryopreserved embryos. Hum. Reprod., 10, 3332–3337.
- Tan, S.L., Doyle, P., Campbell, S. et al. (1992) Obstetric outcome of in vitro

Preimplantation embryo culture and gene expression

- fertilisation pregnancies compared with normally conceived pregnancies. *Am. J. Obstet. Gynecol.*, **167**, 778–784.
- Tanbo, T., Dale, P.O., Lunde, O. et al. (1995) Obstetric outcome in singleton pregnancies after assisted reproduction. Obstet. Gynecol., 86, 188–192.
- Tarlatzis, B.C. and Grimbizis, G. (1999) Pregnancy and child outcome after assisted reproduction techniques. *Hum. Reprod.*, **14** (Suppl. 1), 231–242.
- Tesarik, J. and Mendoza, C. (1999) *In vitro* fertilization by intracytoplasmic sperm injection. *BioEssays*, **21**, 791–801.
- te Velde, E.R., van Laar, A.L. and van Kooij, R.J. (1998) Concerns about assisted reproduction. *Lancet*, **351**, 1524–1525.
- Thompson, J.G. (1997) Comparison between *in vivo*-derived and *in vitro*-produced pre-elongation embryos from domestic ruminants. *Reprod. Fertil. Dev.*, **9**, 341–354.
- Thompson, J.G., Gardner, D.K., Pugh, P.A. *et al.* (1995) Lamb birth weight is affected by culture system utilized during *in vitro* pre-elongation development of ovine embryos. *Biol. Reprod.*, **53**, 1385–1391.
- Thomson, J.A., Itskovits-Eldor, J., Shapiro, S.S. *et al.* (1998) Embryonic stem cell lines derived from human blastocysts. *Science*, **282**, 1145–1147.
- Thorvaldsen, J.L., Duran, K.L. and Bartolomei, M.S. (1998) Deletion of the *H19* differentially methylated domain results in loss of imprinted expression of *H19* and *Igf2*. *Genes Dev.*, **12**, 3693–3702.
- Tilghman, S.M. (1999) The sins of the fathers and the mothers: genomic imprinting in mammalian development. *Cell*, **96**, 185–193.
- Ungaro, P., Casola, S., Vernucci, M. et al. (1997) Relaxation of insulin-like growth factor-2 imprinting in rat cultured cells. Mol. Cell. Endocrinol., 135, 153–163.
- van der Auwera, I., Pijnenborg, R. and Koninck, P.R. (1999) The influence of in-vitro culture versus stimulated and untreated oviductal environment on mouse embryo development and implantation. *Hum. Reprod.*, 14, 2570–2574.
- van Langendonckt, A., Donnay, I., Schuurbiers, N. et al. (1997) Effects of supplementation with fetal calf serum on development of bovine embryos in synthetic oviduct fluid. J. Reprod. Fertil., 109, 87–93.
- van Steirteghem, A. (1998) Outcome of assisted reproductive technology. *N. Engl. J. Med.*, **338**, 194–195.
- Voncken, J.W., Schweizer, D., Aagaard, L. et al. (1999) Chromatin association of the polycomb group protein BMI1 is cell cycle-regulated and correlates with its phosphorylation status. J. Cell Sci., 112, 4637 4630
- Waddington, C.H. (1942) Canalization of development and inheritance of acquired characters. *Nature*, 150, 563–565.
- Wakayama, T. and Yanagimachi, R. (1999) Cloning of male mice from adult tail-tip cells. *Nature Genet.*, **22**, 127–128.
- Wakayama, T., Perry, A.C., Zuccotti, M. et al. (1998) Full-term development of mice from enucleated oocytes injected with cumulus cell nuclei. Nature, 394, 369–374.
- Wakayama, T., Rodriguez, I., Perry A.C. et al. (1999) Mice cloned from embryonic stem cells. Proc. Natl Acad. Sci. USA, 96, 14984–14989.

- Walker, S.K., Heard, T.M., Bee, C.A. *et al.* (1992) *In vitro* culture of sheep embryos with out co-culture: successes and perspectives. *Theriogenology*, **37**, 111–126.
- Walker, S.K., Hartwich, K.M. and Seamark, R.F. (1996) The production of unusually large offspring following embryo manipulation: concepts and challenges. *Theriogenology*, **45**, 111–120.
- Wang, J.X., Clark, A.M., Kirby, C.A. et al. (1994) The obstetric outcome of singleton pregnancies following in-vitro fertilization/gamete intrafallopian transfer. Hum. Reprod., 9, 141–146.
- Wang, Z., Kiefer, F. and Wagner, E.F. (1997) Generation of completely embryonic stem cell-derived mutant mice using tetraploid blastocyst injection. *Mech. Dev.*, 62, 137–145.
- Wells, D.N., Misica, P.M., Day, A.M. and Tervit, H.R. (1997) Production of cloned lambs from an established embryonic cell line: a comparison between *in vivo*- and *in vitro*-matured cytoplasts. *Biol. Reprod.*, 57, 385–393.
- Wells, D.N., Misica, P.V. and Tervit, H.R. (1999) Production of cloned calves following nuclear transfer with cultured adult mural granulosa cells. *Biol. Reprod.*, 60, 996–1005.
- Wennerholm, U.B., Bergh, C., Hamberger, L. et al. (1996) Obstetric and perinatal outcome of pregnancies following intracytoplasmic sperm injection. *Hum. Reprod.*, **11**, 1113–1119.
- Wennerholm, U.B., Hamberger, L., Nilsson, L. *et al.* (1997) Obstetric and perinatal outcome of children conceived from cryopreserved embryos. *Hum. Reprod.*, **12**, 1819–1825.
- Wilmut, I. and Sales, D.I. (1981) Effect of an asynchronous environment on embryonic development in sheep. *J. Reprod. Fertil.*, **61**, 179–184.
- Wilmut, I., Schnieke, A.E., McWhir, J. et al. (1997) Viable offspring derived from fetal and adult mammalian cells. Nature, 385, 810–813.
- Wilson, J.M., Williams, J.D., Bondioli K.R. et al. (1995) Comparison of birth weight and growth characteristics of bovine calves produced by nuclear transfer (cloning), embryo transfer and natural mating. Anim. Reprod. Sci., 38, 73–83.
- Wisanto, A., Bonduelle, M., Camus, M. et al. (1996) Obstetric outcome of 904 pregnancies after intracytoplasmic sperm injection. Hum. Reprod., 11 (Suppl. 4), 121–129.
- Yoder, J.A., Walsh, C.P. and Bestor, T.H. (1997) Cytosine methylation and the ecology of intragenomic parasites. *Trends Genet.*, 13, 335–340.
- Young, L.E. and Fairburn, H.R. (2000) Improving the safety of embryo technologies: possible roles of genomic imprinting. *Theriogenology*, 53, 627-648
- Young, L.E., Sinclair, K.D. and Wilmut, I. (1998) Large offspring syndrome in cattle and sheep. *Rev. Reprod.*, 3, 155–163.
- Young, L.E., Fernandes, K., McEvoy, T.G. *et al.* (2001) Epigenetic change in *IGF2R* is associated with fetal overgrowth after sheep embryo culture. *Nature Genet.*, **27**, 153–154.

Received on October 20, 2000; accepted on April 5, 2001